Rewriting Pathological Passion: Voices from Beyond in Kate Bush’s “Wuthering Heights”

Alumno/a: Cristina Ramírez Sánchez

Tutor/a: Prof. D. Julio Ángel Olivares Merino
Dpto.: Filología Inglesa

Julio, 2016
Index

1. Introduction..................................................................................................................3

2. Kate Bush and Emily Brontë: two women, two contexts........12

3. “Wuthering Heights”, the song: origins.........................................................17

4. “Wuthering Heights”: an audiovisual aftermath.........................19

5. Conclusion....................................................................................................................37

6. Bibliography...............................................................................................................39
Abstract 1: This study’s objective is that of establishing similarities as well as differences between Wuthering Heights by Emily Brontë (a classic of English literature) and the homonym song by Kate Bush, a sort of spin-off deriving from the novel with a new point of view. Taking as a basis different theories applied to Bush’s lyrics as well as offering an insight into both official video clip productions, we will analyze pathological passion as the epicentric topic in the song.

Keywords: love, pathological passion, hate, dependence, identity, subjugation

Abstract 2: El objetivo de este estudio no es otro que establecer similitudes así como diferencias entre Cumbres Borrascosas de Emily Brontë (un clásico de la literatura inglesa) y la canción homónima de Kate Bush, que no es sino un spin-off de dicha novela con un nuevo punto de vista. Tomando como base diversas teorías aportadas a la materia por críticos especializados, se analizarán las letras del tema en cuestión, ofreciendo una aproximación a los dos videoclips oficiales de “Wuthering Heights”, subrayando en todo momento la pasión patológica como base tematizada en la canción.

Palabras clave: amor, pasión patológica, odio, dependencia, identidad, subyugación

1. INTRODUCTION

Written by Emily Brontë, Wuthering Heights was published in 1847 and was received as a controversial novel. Touchy topics such as love relationships between people belonging to different social classes were dealt with. Good and evil, love and hate is the core of Brontë’s only prose work. The pathological link that the female character feels towards Heathcliff (and Heathcliff towards Catherine) has been the main target of analysis for several critics. We must not forget that Catherine and Heathcliff will experience a tormented love tainted with tragedy because of betrayal.

The objective of this paper is no other that analyzing the afterthought of Wuthering Heights proposed by Kate Bush, the way Bush sees how Catherine may feel. In order to do so, this study will present a contextualization of the biographies of Emily Brontë and Kate Bush, considering their times. The following step will be a comparison between the novel and the song to establish differences and similarities at different levels. Having enough background to
be able to carry out the analysis of the song, both the lyrics and the paralinguistic aspects will be considered. Analysts, philosophers and critics’ theories will be used as a base.

Let us, first of all, touch on the difference between hypertext and hypotext (Genette, 1997: 397). The former being “almost always fictional –its fiction derived from another fiction or from the narrative of a real event” (Ibídem, 397), whereas hypotext is the original source of the hypertext. That is, Brontë’s novel is the hypotext on which Bush’s hypertextual song is based, therefore the spin-off of such story.

There is a difference when taking into account the writing style of the novel and the song: the former is a narration, and the latter is narrative poetry. The novel opposes the poetic version in that the song is marked with a monologue or soliloquy structure and just one voice. Wuthering Heights presents several narrators and voices, not only monologues but also dialogues, and an epistolary passage. Moreover, the structure of both discourses is different; while Wuthering Heights relies on flash-backs, the song does not. The lyrics present a linear structure differing from the novel’s chronology.

The lyrics of Kate Bush’s “Wuthering Heights” have a visual rendition in a couple of music video clips offering two different perspectives according to their audiences (European and American). Both video versions help Kate Bush to convey the meaning of her lyrics; she uses a foggy atmosphere in the UK video clip and isolated woods in the US release. The poetic voice, Cathy, experiences a progressive change in the way she refers to Heathcliff: from the collective pronoun “we” –including both the focalizer and focalized, mixing them up as a unit– to the second person singular “you”, then to the third person “he” and finally to “you” again, as a signal of a process of detachment symbolizing Catherine’s errant state. She is between the living and the dead world. Placed in an abyss, she wants to enter the living world to bring Heathcliff to her limbo.

Since Kate Bush performs the role of a ghostly Catherine, a new perspective is presented to the readers of the novel (where she remains silent when she dies and where the writer does not provide the readership with Catherine’s feelings from the beyond). But both Wuthering Heights and Kate Bush’s song portray the same agony and love desperation, as well as dependence on the lover’s existence and its subsequent pathological passion. Catherine’s depiction of her mixed feelings is well-accomplished by the songwriter in lines like “I hated you. I loved you, too” (line 7).

The following lines from Wuthering Heights constitute the real basis for this study and its lens (pathological passion), which is as well the basis for Kate Bush’s spin-off. In chapter XVI Catherine dies, and Heathcliff, in a distress attitude, says:
May she wake in torment! (…) And I pray one prayer—I repeat it till my tongue stiffens—Catherine Earnshaw, may you not rest, as long as I’m living! You said I killed you—haunt me, then! The murdered do haunt their murderers, I believe. I know that ghosts have wandered on earth. Be with me always—take any form—drive me mad! Only do not leave me in this abyss, where I cannot find you! Oh, God! It is unutterable! I cannot live without my life! I cannot live without my soul! (Brontë, 1990: 129).

This fragment is most probably Bush’s referent to her interpretation of the novel. She writes the perspective of a tormented Catherine, settled in the other side. We should not forget that the song is a non-official continuation, or spin-off, of the novel.

Another important aspect to focus on is the different kinds of voices appearing in both the song and the novel. According to Bao’s study (2015: 90-91), when describing the types of narrators in relation to voice, it may be necessary to indicate first the different levels of narration found in Wuthering Heights, a frame narration (not a functional structure in the song), since there are levels within others. Two main levels are to be found in the novel: in this case Lockwood’s and Nelly’s.¹ Lockwood—narrator of the first level narration—is the one who introduces Nelly’s narration—second level of narration—, and who also closes it. All narrators taking part in the story are homodiegetic, that is, they are often present in the action. In the song there is only Catherine’s voice; her feelings, sufferings and requirements. It is narrated from her point of view, that of a woman.

It seems evident that the main narrators are Lockwood and Nelly. According to Gérard Genette (1997), there are three different levels in every narration process. The first one is extradiegetic, which has to do with the characters involved in the plot and who collect all the information. The following level is intradiegetic, making allusion to the circumstances developed in the written text. The third narrative level is metadiegetic, dealing with the narratives occurring within the second level, intradiegetic. So, as a result, the extradiegetic level in the novel is constituted by Lockwood, the intradiegetic by Nelly and the metadiegetic by Isabella’s letter, for instance, as well as the notes that Lockwood finds on the margins of Catherine’s books. Kate Bush’s Cathy is also an intradiegetic narrator because she is involved in the story.

Focalization, which has to do with mood, is a concept that was coined by Genette in Figures III (1979). The reason why it was necessary to create such a concept was the problem

¹ However, other characters take on the role of narrator, as Isabella Linton in the letter she sends to Ellen to clarify the doubts she has concerning Heathcliff’s evil and insensitive behaviour, and also Zillah, Cathy, as well as Heathcliff.
in which the plot of a story is seen through a particular perspective by means of a mediator (the narrator), even though this mediator may be telling a story without considering his or her own perspective. Focalization and narration exist at the same level and simultaneously in film, but focalization is previous to the narration and thus, can be regarded as independent from the former. According to Genette, there are three different types of focalization from the mood aspect:

Zero focalization is the one that tradition called “omniscient narration”. In *Wuthering Heights* we can find no evidence of this type because all narrators involved in the novel are not present in all events and they are first person narrators having limited knowledge about what has happened, is happening or may happen, also affected by the action and, hence, somehow telling the story in unreliable terms; Ellen should rely on Lockwood’s retelling of the events and the other way around. As Genette considered, it is not obligatory to have a whole piece of writing in which just one of these classifications, as the zero classification, can be applied. This level of focalization was called by the French anthropologist and writer Pouillon “vision from behind” (Genette, 1983: 188-189).

The second type is called internal focalization and it presents the focus on a character that is present when an event is taking place, that is, something that the character has witnessed. Pouillon called this “vision with” (1983: 188-189). The narration by Ellen Dean (the main one) and Lockwood’s (the shortest one due to his delegation to Ellen) are examples of internal focalization, since they both tell stories in which they have been witnesses or taking an active part in a specific conversation or moment. Cathy’s narration in Kate Bush’s song is also in this level of focalization.

The last type is called external focalization, or “vision from without” in Pouillon’s words (1983: 188-189), in which the reader has no access to the emotions or thoughts of the characters, as is the case of Catherine’s feelings towards Edgar Linton and Heathcliff. The reader knows what Catherine feels towards them by means of her actions.

Topics as patriarchy and social customs are themes that serve as a basis for this study since they are dealt with in the novel and indirectly reflected on the novel (denial of male roles but subjugation to them). In his study “Female Consciousness in *Wuthering Heights*” (2011), Juan Zhao studies patriarchy and the social customs at Emily Brontë’s times. In her century, her novel was not fully accepted, being even considered “a compound of vulgar

---

depravity and unnatural horrors”.³ Things changed in the twentieth century, where it began to be recognized as a masterpiece. From being regarded as a brazen author, Brontë was turned into one of the biggest writers of her epoch. These two centuries are a turning point as far as the female role in society is concerned. At the end of the nineteenth century the status of the woman started to experiment changes thanks to Queen Victoria (1819-1901). It is in these years when the origins of feminism are found and the era of female writers is settled.

However, as Zhao points out (2011: 27), Emily differs from her contemporary female authors. While they were touching on feminist topics and openly supported equal marriages and free love, the fifth Brontë daughter was more cautious and did not deal with such topics in the same way. Somehow, she was regarded as an inspiring feminist icon (although she was criticized⁴). Whereas women were considered to be fragile and of little hand, Emily Brontë showed to her readership a distinct facet of the secondary sex: a woman who confronts the male characters of the novel and patriarchy in general (although she depends on).

Her attitude towards the age is reflected in Wuthering Heights. Sara Saei Dibavar establishes a comparison between the main character in her novel, Catherine (Brontë’s doppelgänger), and Emily Brontë, the author. Catherine “is a representative of Brontë as a writing subject” (Saei, 2014: 2) and, to be more specific, the female heroine is seen as the author in a “larger scale” (ibidem, 2). In contrast with Bush’s song structure, Brontë creates another self in writing, and she does so with a particular purpose:

Like Catherine that writes not to feel imprisoned, Brontë also writes in order to get rid of the suppression inflicted upon her as a female member of the nineteenth century English society. (Saei, 2014:2).

Connected with Brontë’s Wuthering Heights is Frankenstein (1847), by Mary Shelley. According to Gilbert and Gubar’s The Madwoman in the Attic (2000) both novels are classical, famous and “literary puzzles” (Gilbert and Gubar, 2000: 249). Despite their differences, these two stories have things in common, listed as “enigmatic, puzzling, even in some sense generically problematical” (249). The authors consider their story-telling narration a style that insists on the different approaches through varied prisms and points of

view. This marks Brontë as a possible heiress of Shelley’s narrative style if the critic is to be overlooking Shelley’s and Brontë’s literary context (full of literate surroundings).

As recognized in Gilbert and Gubar’s (2000: 256), the myth of Brontë’s beginnings is linked to Milton and Blake. Nikolopoulou also noted this, and wrote: “she inverted Milton’s hell into heaven, but more radical than Blake, she did so through the portrayal of a woman, who shunned the rules of patriarchal Christianity” (2012: 26).

Brontë seems to be strongly connected in criticism with Milton’s *Paradise Lost* (1667), since references to Heaven and hell are drawn across the book, as in Heathcliff’s words when Catherine passed away: “Where is she? Not *there*–not in heaven–not perished–where?” (Brontë, 1990: 129), which is, by the way, a question to be answered by Kate Bush in the following sections. *Paradise Lost* is also connected to Catherine’s declarations about heaven when she had a strange dream: “If I were in heaven, Nelly, I should be extremely miserable” (Brontë, 1990: 62) and continues saying:

> Heaven did not seem to be my home; and I broke my heart with weeping to come back to earth; and the angels were so angry that they flung me out, into the middle of the heath on the top of Wuthering Heights, where I woke sobbing for joy. (62)

In the same way in which Emily Brontë was apparently influenced by the writings of her contemporary Mary Shelley and *Frankenstein*, another Shelley also determined her literary path and subsequent career: Percy Shelley’s poetical work *Epipsychidion* (1821). According to Nikolopoulou;

> Brontë’s relation to Shelley can be revealed to be one not of opposition, but the highest realization as well as the most catastrophic radicalization of the Romantic ideals of love and creativity. By not fighting Shelley, Brontë reaches the precarious heights of freedom he strove for. (2012: 29)

Brontë read Shelley’s poem *Epipsychidion*, addressed to his lover Emily, and soon she identified herself with this addressee. In her reading of the poem she created new identities, as the one she generated to publish her works. The writer coined Ellis Bell as her pseudonym to release *Wuthering Heights*. Though it could seem contradictory, this is a larger way of representing Catherine’s desperate search for a specific status: a despairing search for a social status that neither Catherine nor Emily were able to gain.
As Saei marked in her essay “Playing Safe: The Writer behind the Text of *Wuthering Heights*” (2014), the creation of her doubling constitutes a way of escaping from her world, Brontë’s toeing-the-lines life. In order to do so, the author developed an intrepid and fearless character that went beyond her personal borders, whom Kate Bush later recovered in her song:

Catherine becomes rebellious while Brontë herself clings fast to the principle of reality and sublimates her desire through finally directing Catherine to her death penalty, which is the destiny for an excess seeker (Saei, 2014: 2).

Not all critics considered this possible approach to punishment, since some authors showed their disapproval of Emily Brontë when she did not directly comment nor show rejection towards Catherine’s actions in the novel. What she did wrong is her desperate looking for richness in her attempt to improve her social status, without taking into account Heathcliff’s love for her, not even her own feelings for him. Cathy married Edgar Linton whom he sort of loved as well, though her attachment for him was not the mad love she felt towards the so-called villain of the story.

The song deals with Catherine from the other side as a ghost. She feels guilty because she has wronged Heathcliff and now wants him back to find the peace she decided to lose when marrying Edgar Linton: she loves him, but not as she loves the anti-hero. However, there is a problem between the couple: the separation between the living world and the beyond makes impossible their relationship. In the song, Cathy does not get feedback from Heathcliff, so she starts a never-ending progression. She stops it towards the end of the song, admitting her defeat.

Through her doppelgänger, the author experiences a guilty pleasure of “being an outlaw (...) while saving herself from the abject allure” (Saei, 2014: 2). Emily uses Catherine to shield herself from the patriarchal institution and the contemporary thought. As Brontë’s heroine, she resists the authoritarian pattern of patriarchy, but somehow Catherine is stuck to male roles. She rebels against men involved in the plot: her father, her brother and lover Heathcliff, and her own husband. Even though she does so with one and only objective: “protecting her self-awareness” (Zhao, 2011: 27), her decision is the result of the slave experience resulting from the dependence Catherine undergoes. Related to this, Nikolopoulou’s asserts:

---

Had she been as uncompromising as a feminist reading may wish for, Catherine would not marry for marriage’s sake, let alone marry Edgar. But she married him because he was a marriageable one: her own mark of conformism, and her tragic mistake. (2012: 31)

These lines express Catherine’s relying on the other and her inability to stay on her own independence and freedom far from other’s company. She seems to be determined to handcuff herself to a man, though she sometimes opposes them. And she does so in a double sense: she marries Linton (and therefore, ties herself to his richness and social status), but keeps loving Heathcliff inevitably.

In connection with Stoneman’s study, the story created by Percy Shelley is constituted by “a blending of identities which has come to be called the ‘twin-soul’ idea” (quoted in Nikolopoulou, 2012: 30), that consists of two indivisible selves joined to create just one. And this may be the model that Brontë would follow in Catherine and Heathcliff’s love story up to the point of losing each other’s identity: “Nelly, I am Heathcliff” (Brontë, 1990: 64) implies that they are just one person, being each one the half of the other, as a coin, where it is impossible to have one without the other. In the song, the same tendency of dependence is provided by Bush’s Cathy.

What does the reader know about Heathcliff’s identity? He was adopted by Catherine’s father, but he did not provide either his family or the readers with an explanation different or more detailed than the sympathetic reasons. Perhaps the loss of identity experienced by Catherine is due to Heathcliff’s lack of background: the denying of Heathcliff’s origins may be the reason why she lost her own identity (since they both are a two-sided coin), combined as well with the strong feelings she experienced with his company.

Another pillar for this analysis is the role of Edgar Linton and Heathcliff’s. Dealing with them, James Phillips’s essay on “The Two Face of Love in Wuthering Heights” (2007) noticed how the character of Catherine established a distinction between transcendental and empirical love, where Heathcliff constitutes the transcendental face of love whereas Edgar is the empirical side.

Both Heathcliff and Linton are really different, just as night and day are: Heathcliff is cold and savage while Edgar is warm and well-educated. These two male characters are each side of a two-sided coin, and Catherine is not able to decide which side suits her better, so she

---

6 This is based on Kant’s theories. Kant differentiates the transcendental subject from the empirical one: the transcendental is the realization of the existence of the empirical subject. Applying these concepts to the novel, Heathcliff’s savageness contrasts with Edgar’s correctness, and in the same way the former’s passion with the latter’s warmth.
chooses both. The female protagonist’s complex love is due to the unfolding of both sides, transcendental and empirical, as embodied by Edgar and Heathcliff. The latter is Catherine’s weakness (in the dependent-love perspective), but she married the former due to social prestige and economical independence, something that Heathcliff could not offer. Gilbert and Gubar conclude:

Edgar's victory (…) recapitulates that earlier victory of Thrushcross Grange over Wuthering Heights which also meant the victory of a Urizenic “heaven” over a delightful and energetic “hell.” At the same time, it seals Catherine's doom, locking her into her downward spiral of self-starvation. (2000: 282)

This refers to the passage where Catherine gets ill and is separated from her “heavenly hell”: Wuthering Heights. The passage is the beginning of Catherine’s discovering of what she wants to achieve. The internal conflict she endures while loving both is shown in Bush’s spin-off, and also illustrated in the novel by Catherine when she provides Ellen Dean with the differences between Edgar and Heathcliff:

My great thought in living is himself [Heathcliff]. If all else perished, and he remained, I should still continue to be; and, if all else remained, and he were annihilated, the Universe would turn to a mighty stranger. [...] My love for Linton is like the foliage in the woods. Time will change it, I’m well aware, as winter changes the trees. My love for Heathcliff resembles the eternal rocks beneath –a source of little visible delight, but necessary. (Brontë, 1990: 64)

Catherine uses figurative language to compare her love for Linton with Heathcliff’s. She is determined to live as long as the latter lives, so her love seems not likely to change. If compared with Cathy’s love projected towards Linton, she talks of the foliage in the woods and, as she explains, this love is likely to experiment modifications by the passing of time.

As the plot thickens, readers are able to notice the conflict between Linton and Heathcliff in Catherine’s head and heart. Therefore, the battle between the two sides of the coin starts. Kant unfolded the two faces of a coin, or a subject, in order to explain his concepts (Azeri, 2010: 271), motivated by an attempt to create a theory that excluded individualism.

Related to Kant’s concepts, Phillips states that “what love really, generally is, is both empirical and transcendental” (2007: 97). This love is unfolded into Linton and Heathcliff, making Catherine love them in different but inseparable ways:
The transcendental aspect of love admits a different formulation in *Wuthering Heights*. The cruelty does not have to be conceived as the guardian of sexual abstinence; the cruelty is in the service of the transcendental aspect of love because it is the test of empirical destructibility from which the bond between Catherine and Heathcliff is to emerge triumphant. (Phillips, 2007: 99)

Phillips here considers how Catherine tested her love. If each side of the coin is defined by means of excluding everything the other side is, does Catherine’s love for Linton contribute in any way to Catherine’s love for Heathcliff and the other way around? She loves Linton for all those things Heathcliff is not. And she loves Heathcliff in an irrational way because he is everything but Linton. So, is Catherine’s perfect lover a mix of both men? Phillips concludes “she must love both in order for the love she feels for Heathcliff to be what it is and in order for the love she feels for Linton to be what it is” (2007: 100). Phillips’ and Kant’s studies support the idea of the possibility of loving two different people for the mere reason that these subjects are enormously distinctive in some feature or characteristic.

Loving Heathcliff and Linton and marrying the latter makes her feel guilty because she is not sincere enough with herself. In Kate Bush’s spin-off, as it will be seen, Catherine will try to correct her mistakes and value Heathcliff’s love as much as she should have had when she was in the living world.

2. **KATE BUSH AND EMILY BRONTË: TO WOMEN, TWO CONTEXTS**

Two women belonging to different epochs are linked thanks to a place called *Wuthering Heights*. In this section, their lives will be reviewed to be familiar with their surroundings and the life experiences that influenced them. Emily Brontë is a well-known writer of the Victorian period (1832-1900), whose real setting is reflected on *Wuthering Heights*. This woman, the writer of an early psychological novel, is to be compared with the British singer Kate Bush, who was born in Kent in 1958. Daughter of a British physicist and a renowned traditional Irish dancer, Bush taught herself piano due to her father’s influence (he was an accomplished pianist). She also studied violin and played the organ. She started to write her own music and eventually added some lyrics to them. The little genius was discovered at her early sixteen thanks to David Gilmour, Pink Floyd’s co-lead vocalist, a mutual friend of the family.
According to Gilmour’s advice, EMI Music signed a deal with Bush when the enterprise was already one of the biggest music companies in the world. Her talent was then allowed to bright. In contrast with her will, EMI wanted “James And The Cold Gun” to become her first single and her debut song. But Kate Bush insisted on “Wuthering Heights” (an Art Pop style song) to be so; and she achieved it. From that moment on she was respected by EMI Music and they took her opinion into account; she was decided not to be manipulated by others’ considerations. Bush’s determination led her to become the first female to top the UK charts with a self-composed song.

A non-feminist movement follower, Bush always seems sensitive in supporting revolutionary ideas as women independence and rebellion (or better, subversion), and female power was born at that time to contradict the commands of a patriarchal society and a music industry traditionally driven by men. And this is linked to the role of Catherine in Wuthering Heights, though, as it has been commented above, it is a contradiction in itself: Catherine opposed every male character in the novel, but she fully depended on them.

In fact, when Kate Bush was interviewed by Janice Long (Greater London Radio, 1989) and was asked about whether or not she was a feminist, she answered:

God, I hate that word (...) I think that it’s really unfortunate that that word has been so associated with very (...) radical behaviour. And I think although it probably had to be put in a bit at the beginning, I think all women are rather offended by that term now. What really has power is when you get people like Jennifer Saunders and Dawn French up there doing something really good, as women, being people, just being women. Women just getting on with it and doing it, and doing it well. Which I think a lot of women are doing now. And there’s no such an alienating process going on between men and women.

A female singer like her, belonging to that small heap of female artists allowed to make use of their artistic freedom and female creativity, was able to defy her age without being heavily criticized by the media, and simply no one questioned that.

Her style was a remembrance of the Old Wave (1960s) and the singers and bands taking part of it, as her discoverer David Gilmour. Soon she would become a pioneer in using

---

7 The common, non-walking-outside-the-lines track: the type of song that would fit in most people’s tastes.
9 Reference: http://gaffa.org/cloud/subjects/feminism.html
cutting-edge technologies to be applied to her music. In fact, it was her boldness that made her able to run her own business: Fish People, Bush’s record label. She would release her ninth album, “Director’s Cut” (2011) with this company. What motivated Bush to do so was her constant search for creative freedom, as she recognized in an interview:

“I’m delighted with my own label because it means that I have more creative freedom, which is really what I want. Although I’ve always had a lot of creative freedom since my third album. But now, I don’t have to refer to people at the record company for certain decisions that I might have before (Interview by Ryan Dombal, May 2011)."

Though Bush’s desire “was never to be famous” but “to try and create something interesting”, she was aware of the difficulty of being able to break the US market. In fact, “Wuthering Heights” was a hit everywhere but there. The new sound of her music did not completely fit in the taste of the Americans. Some journalists considered Kate Bush’s music (with an English and Irish musical base) to be defiantly different from American pop. Only “The Man With The Child In His Eyes” was able to make a mark in the US charts with its instrumentality. This song is related to “Wuthering Heights”, the track that follows it. “The Man With The Child In His Eyes” also deals with someone who is not there and is missed by the performer of the song. The man of this track is interpreted as an adult in whom the singer sees a common feature to all men: they have a little boy inside.

Her first album was called “The Kick Inside”, 1978, (including Bush’s debut “Wuthering Heights”), and displays sensual imagery and delicate sexual symbolism by means of dancing and the meaning behind the red dress she wears in the American video version, as it will be seen in the subsequent sections. Kate Bush likes to draw outside the lines, and for this reason she was an icon when taking her first steps in the global music industry.

In a first stage, the release of her debut was scheduled to be 4th November 1977. Owing to the artist’s discontentment with the cover, it was to be changed. EMI Music Company launched its release in New Year, which turned out to be the best choice, since the release at an earlier date would have surely meant a clash with other artists’ release. As a

10 New editing devices (such as better image texture) and musical innovations like analogue synthesizers (that ruled the electronic music scene of the 70s) as the Yamaha CS-80 (the one she used on her first stages), LinnDrum machines (digital drums), etc. Sources: http://www.musictech.net/2014/11/landmark-productions-kate-bush-hounds-of-love/ and http://www.musicradar.com/news/tech/the-21-most-important-music-technology-innovations-of-all-time-613606

11 Reference to the interview at http://pitchfork.com/features/interview/7968-kate-bush/

12 As she stated when interviewed by Dimitri Ehrlich, Interview Magazine (2011). Website: http://www.interviewmagazine.com/music/kate-bush/print/
consequence, it would have been probable that “Wuthering Heights” would have not topped the charts in the United Kingdom.

It is also the case that Bush’s music has wide intertextual connections with other literary works, beyond Emily Brontë’s novel. As a matter of fact, Kate Bush is interested in philosophy and existentiality. In her first interviews she was already commenting on Kafka’s conventions and Joyce\(^\text{13}\). Her second hit, “Them Heavy People” mentions the mystic philosopher Gurdjieff. It differs from “Wuthering Heights” but Bush managed to leave her print on it. There are also songs with sexual content just as “Feel It” and “L’Amour Looks Something Like You”, and heartbreaking songs like “Oh To Be In Love” and the one that gives name to the album, “The Kick Inside”.

The new music star also dedicated some lyrics to feminine topics such as menstruation (“Strange Phenomena”) and giving birth (“Room For The Life”). Described by the BBC as a “young, liberally-educated mind”,\(^\text{14}\) the artist set a pattern for her future work.

According to Kate Bush’s interviews, she found the process of writing the song concerning this study quite difficult. She had to reflect the essential plot of a novel of almost three hundred pages in a song of three or four minutes. Yet she wrote it without a previous reading of the book (just by picking up some sentences that she found while glancing at it). It was easy to perform the role of Cathy because when Kate Bush was a child she had always been called as the female protagonist. In this fragment from an interview with Bush, she talks about how she managed to write the song:

> I borrowed the book and read a few pages, picking out a few lines. So I actually wrote the song before I had read the book right through (Kate Bush Club Newsletter, January 1979).\(^\text{15}\)

The singer explained in an interview by the Kate Bush Club Newsletter, 1979, that there were “a couple of synchronicities involved in the song”. She had a terrible cold while writing the song, a state she compared with the “terminal stages of consumption” that Emily Brontë experienced when writing the novel. The negative reviews of non-supporters did not affect her; she shielded herself in the positive ones:

> One thing that really pleases me is the amount of positive feedback I’ve had from

\(^{13}\) We will see that she used a fragment from James Joyce’s *Ulysses* in a song.

\(^{14}\) A Kate Bush’s “The Kick Inside” review describing the to-this-day-nothing-sounds-like-it by Chris Jones (BBC Music), 2008.

\(^{15}\) Reference: [http://gaffa.org/garden/kate1.html](http://gaffa.org/garden/kate1.html)
the song, though I've heard that the Bronte Society think it's a disgrace. A lot of people have read the book because of the song and liked it, which I think is the best thing about it for me (Kate Bush Club Newsletter, January 1979).16

Bush resembles Emily Brontë in the rebellion against her times. Emily Jane Brontë (1818-1848) had to use a pseudonym (Ellis Bell, a neuter pen-name) in order to be allowed to publish her poems, stories and her only novel. In fact, the three Brontë sisters did the same not to be judged as the daughters of a clergyman that dedicated their lives to amoral and offensive pieces of writing, as some readers considered them.

She is sometimes regarded as “perhaps the greatest of the three Brontë sisters”.17 Her correspondence has not been fully recovered, and Emily’s shy (when treating non-family members) and independent character does not provide her readers with revealing information about her life. Indeed, as Joyce M. S. Tompkins points out, “her single novel darkens rather than solves the mystery of her spiritual existence”.18 In fact, The Bronte Society considers that “the little information” they have “sometimes appears contradictory”.19

Focusing on Emily’s poetic writings (labeled as strongly religious), the eldest Brontë sister Charlotte, was conscious of Emily’s distinctive character when writing, which she considered to be not “at all like poetry women generally write” (Brontë, 1990: 315). However, Charlotte was not the only one who saw Emily as “stronger than a man, simpler than a child” and with a nature that “stood alone” (Brontë, 1990: 318). Emily’s schoolmaster said, during her stay in Brussels: “She should have been a man – a great navigator… her strong, imperious will would never have been daunted by opposition or difficulty” (quoted in Gilbert and Gubar, 1996: 784).

Both Emily Brontë’s and Bush’s works were seen as striking but also shocking issues at the time they were published or released. Even though Kate Bush did not have to cover her identity, her work was regarded as impudent and she was criticized because “she turns the famous examination text by Emily Brontë into glorious soap opera trauma”.20 These women stood outside the social conventions of their times. In addition, neither Brontë nor Bush had ever previously done something as they did. Brontë wrote poetry but she had never published

16 Source: http://gaffa.org/garden/kate1.html
17 According to Joyce M. S. Tompkins. More information in https://global.britannica.com/biography/Emily-Bronte
18 Website: https://global.britannica.com/biography/Emily-Bronte
20 Melody Maker words on “Wuthering Heights”. Source: http://www.katebushencyclopedia.com/wuthering-heights
a novel and the same with Bush, a young girl who had never released a song. Both women were discovering new lands, and both products resulted to be a success.

3. “WUTHERING HEIGHTS”, THE SONG: ORIGINS

Why did Bush write “Wuthering Heights”? She had the idea of composing it when she saw the last scenes of a BBC adaptation of Brontë’s novel. It would be interesting at this point to make reference to the hypotext-hypertext concepts Genette theorized on (1997: 397). Hypotext is the original source of a text, and hypertext is what derives from that earlier version. Hence Wuthering Heights, the novel, is the hypotext of Kate Bush’s song “Wuthering Heights”, whose video-clips are hypertexts on the basis of another hypotext (the song). The adaptation on screen that Kate Bush watched finishing was the 70s film directed by Robert Fuest and starring Timothy Dalton and Anna Caulder Marshall. This is what the singer said in an early interview, published in 1978:

I just caught the last few minutes where she was at the window trying to get in. [...] It just fascinated me. What an incredible situation that people should want something so much that even when they die they won’t let go. It is a greed of some kind... or a greedy-need, that’s the word. It was just fascinating me so much, it kept coming into my brain. I thought the only way to get rid of it and stop it bothering me was to write it down.

And so she did. As previously stated, Kate Bush did not read the book while writing the song, but she had to read the novel to perform the role of Catherine, a character she described as treacherous and selfish. Nonetheless, her debut single was not the only track dealing with literature: The singer also wrote “The Sensual World”, including direct references to James Joyce’s Ulysses. She based her inspiration in Joyce’s Molly Bloom soliloquies at the end of the novel. At first, she was not allowed to use a fragment from Ulysses and abandoned the project, but she was finally given permission after a second try, which took place twenty years after.

EMI Music released several different CD sleeves covers for “The Kick Inside” (1978). On the main one (the yellow one below) there is an eye at the back that could be regarded as a reference to the song that EMI wanted to present as her debut, “The Man With The Child In

---

21 Website: http://brendanmartin.tripod.com/
22 Belonging to her sixth album equally named, “The Sensual World” (1989).
His Eyes”. In the pin-up design of the cover there is also a kite to which Kate Bush is attached (an allusion to “Kite”, the fourth track in her debut album). Since it was her first album to be published, the kite symbol may be directly connected with the freedom that Bush felt when releasing her songs. The design seems to be inspired in the Chinese culture; the typography of the letters, the way in which they are written (downwards) and the dragon in the kite may lead the audience to think so. This was the sleeve used on several international releases.

However, there is a more traditional sleeve (for the American CD) in which Kate Bush represents the prototypical country singer, sitting on the floor, enclosing her leg. This one represents the classical approach for a record. The photography was chosen from a session with Gered Mankowitz and can be seen above on the right.

As Bush did with the CD sleeves, she released two different video versions. The former was made for the British and European audiences whereas the latter was addressed at her American followers. In the United Kingdom’s version, Kate Bush is wearing a white dress while standing on a dark, empty and foggy atmosphere. The American production placed the artist in a (also misty) wood while wearing a red dress.

Why two different video versions for the same song? “Wuthering Heights” was a hit everywhere but the United States, an audience that Bush was not able to get to. Even though she topped the British charts, she presented two visual variants of the same song maybe due to

---

23 All picture rights in this project belong to EMI Music and Kate Bush.
24 Gered Mankowitz (1946-) is a renowned photographer in the music world that has worked with Jimi Hendrix, Oasis, Elton John, etc. More at: [http://www.mankowitz.com/about/](http://www.mankowitz.com/about/)
Kate’s awareness of the difficulty of breaking the American market, something that she would try to accomplish through an adaptation of her product.

As in the stills below, Bush decided to decorate the UK’s video setting in a dark, foggy environment and using double-exposure effects. However, the American’s video scene is set on the woods, a natural setting. The differences and similarities of both audiovisual representations will be described in depth in the following section.

The rollercoaster of love and hate

4. “WUTHERING HEIGHTS”, THE SONG: AN AUDIOVISUAL AFTERMATH

Once contextual aspects have been dealt with, the core of this research is to analyze the lyrics of “Wuthering Heights” as well as its paralinguistic rendition in both video clip versions released by EMI Music.

To analyze the lyrics it is necessary to know about the novel. Emily Brontë’s *Wuthering Heights* deals with a tormented love relationship. Heathcliff is adopted in Catherine’s family and they fall in love with each other. However, the unclear social status of Heathcliff leads Catherine to marry Edgar Linton, who comes from a wealthy and cultivated family. Heathcliff disappears for three years and when he comes back to Wuthering Heights, he is determined to take revenge on Catherine.

The song expresses Catherine’s cyclical journey (she gets closer to him but then distances again) and her mixed feelings, telling Heathcliff that she hated him but she also loved him. Those past tenses imply that she is no longer in position of speaking about the present, since she is a ghost speaking from the other side. Catherine remembers past times and reproaches Heathcliff for not giving her permission (or answer at all) to let her into his world. She embarks on a never-ending experience: she is in the abyss between the living and the
dead worlds and tries to capture Heathcliff in that abyss too. As expressed in the lyrics, she wants to solve the mistakes she made in the past, showing regret. She also starts an endless journey by both approaching his idealized lover and being detached from him by means of switching pronouns from the second to the third person. References to passages from the novel appear in the chorus, as the one in which Catherine knocks on the window asking to be allowed to enter Wuthering Heights once again. Moreover, she states her pathological relationship towards her lover as well as her total dependence on him. No matter how “cruel” Heathcliff is, she needs him and wants to possess him desperately. It is necessary to mention that Wuthering Heights’ scope of action is wider, and Emily Brontë reflected topics different from pathological passion such as pain, family matters, social conventions and classes, even revenge (Heathcliff tormenting little Cathy, Hindley and Isabella Linton), among others.

The lyrics of the song are the basis for our analysis:

“Wuthering Heights” (1978)

Out on the wiley, windy moors
We’d roll and fall in green.
You had a temper like my jealousy:
Too hot, too greedy.
How could you leave me,
When I needed to possess you?
I hated you. I loved you, too.

Bad dreams in the night.
They told me I was going to lose the fight,
Leave behind my wuthering, wuthering
Wuthering Heights.

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!
Let me in-a-your window.

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!
Let me in-a-your window.

Ooh, it gets dark! It gets lonely
On the other side from you.
I pine a lot. I find the lot
Falls through without you.
I'm coming back, love.
Cruel Heathcliff, my one dream.
    My only master.

Too long I roam in the night.
I'm coming back to his side, to put it right.
I'm coming home to wuthering, wuthering.
    Wuthering Heights.

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!
Let me in-a-your window.

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!
Let me in-a-your window.
    Ooh! Let me have it.
Let me grab your soul away.
    Ooh! Let me have it.
Let me grab your soul away.
    You know it's me, Cathy!

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!
Let me in-a-your window.

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!
Let me in-a-your window.

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!
Let me in-a-your window.

Heathcliff, it's me, your Cathy.
I've come home. I'm so cold!

As previously commented, Kate Bush did not read the book when she was in the process of writing the song. She did so afterwards, and was surprised when she caught the essence of the novel by Emily Brontë, the *pathological passion*: a relationship of torturing
and unhealthy dependence where the two people involved love and hate each other. It is important to remember that his continuation is not an official sequel but, somehow, a spin-off.

To begin with, an analysis of the lyrics will be provided with cross-references between the novel, the song, and the two official video clips. The methodology used to describe the lyrics together with the two official videos’ account is based on linguistic aspects as syntax, semantics, figurative and linguistic elements as well as a narratological film analysis, focalization, and music semiotics.

In the video version produced for the UK and European public, the singer represents a ghost (white dress, foggy ambient). This image is reinforced by the fact that Kate Bush is in a dark room, as if she were on the other side. This is directly connected with Catherine’s dead state and her damnation to wander the beyond as a response to her feeling guilty for what she did wrong, also summoned by her victim, Heathcliff, as we have already noted.

The video was directed by Keith “Keef” MacMillan. Compared with the US’s, it is more dynamic. It presents a wide range of shots and appears to be more explicit than the second one with relation to the phantom character (see previous image, where Catherine walks as a ghost) and the place where Cathy is located: foggy, dark, chilly setting, describing a kind of limbo. All shots taken smoothly overlap.

Symmetries and mirror-like shots are present in the UK’s video. This is the first of a number of symmetrical patterns or double projections appearing throughout this video clip. It represents the character’s dual feelings –love and hate–, as we will comment on later. But, what is she trying to tell the audience by means of that partial reflection of herself? Going

---

25 Keith “Keef” Lionel MacMillan (1934-2012) was an artist, designer, director, photographer and producer of several music videos, including bands such as Kiss, Motörhead, Bob Marley and David Bowie.
beyond our simple reference to love and hate opposition, a possible explanation of this is the wider dual character of *Wuthering Heights* in itself: two families (Linton’s and Earnshaw’s) and therefore, two houses (Wuthering Heights and Thrushcross Grange), the already alluded two opposite feelings (love and hate), the two different characters (Heathcliff and Catherine), as well as two different perspectives (the culprit, the victim) and, obviously, Catherine’s lovers (Heathcliff and Edgar Linton), apart from, referring to the novel’s structure and unfolding, the two generations shown.

As the song advances, the look on her face denotes pain, grief. She has a wide open gaze in her eyes. Taking into account both visual representations, Cathy’s ghost emergence from the ground appears to be clearer in the production released for the United Kingdom because of its explicitness in meaning (that is, she emerges from the ground where she is buried). However, it is her disappearance at the end of both videos that seems to be easier to understand from a visual viewpoint in the US version, since she distances from the camera shot while fading away and appearing again and again until she does not appear anymore.

What is more, the music that is played first sounds as the melody introducing a fairy tale, a story typically presented to children. Kate Bush’s musical style is difficult to define, let alone “Wuthering Heights” in particular (a kind of Art Pop song). Hers is a blending of styles, rhythms and timbres impossible to label using just one tag.

At the beginning of the European video, just when the lyrics start, Cathy stands up from where she was (the ground), at the same time the lyrics state “Out on the wiley, windy moors” (line 1). Despite this possible interpretation, she may also be a flower in its full blossom; her arms could be the stalks and her hands the leaves, as shown in the picture from this version:
Another thing to focus on is the colours derived from the lighting appearing in UK’s video clip: yellow, red and blue. One of the meanings of yellow in literary contexts, according to Ferber (1999: 245) is linked to betrayal (what Catherine does to Heathcliff when marrying Linton); red is traditionally associated to passion but also to evilness (ibídem, 1999: 169); the two oppositions dealt with in the love story), and blue is related to “the color of heaven, of hope” (ibídem, 1999: 31) and a signal “of constancy” (1999: 31), which is what Cathy does in Bush’s song: persist and insist on Heathcliff ‘s approval so that they may be together again.26

In fact, this set of colours is known as the primary colours: yellow, red or magenta and blue or cyan, all colours stemming from them, as the original ones.

The audiovisual component of the American version, however, is less explicit than the first one. Catherine is wearing a red dress, a symbol of passion and sensuality. In fact, the role Kate Bush performs is more sensual if compared with the European production. The weather is also misty but the character is now situated in the woods.

![Cathy saying Heathcliff’s name from the other side](image)

Cathy’s facial look is less contorted if compared with the previous video. She seems to be more relaxed and her movements, in general, seem not to be as expressive as in the previous video version. However, the choreography is the same, or very similar if both environments (in which both video clips are developed) are taken into consideration.

At this point, the following step is to analyze the lyrics of the song “Wuthering Heights”. The first two lines “Out on the wiley, windy moors / We’d roll and fall in green” (1-

2) make reference to Wuthering Heights, the place where Catherine and Heathcliff began to grow their friendship and subsequent love but also hate. The “we” explicitly presents a frame of shared experiences, a couple, a unit; it also starts a detaching process that will be commented on along the lyrics continue (Catherine will change her perspective using other pronouns as “you” or “he”). From a syntactic point of view and, more specifically, considering word order, these lines present a fronting phenomenon since the setting—the moors and the inferred related elements, his welcome—is placed at the very beginning of the line—also, the starting point of the lyrics—while the action is postponed. Moreover, “windy” is to be associated with “wuthering”. Talking about the concept of love so far, there are authors as Deleuze and Guattarati who withstand to support the idea of Catherine’s and Heathcliff’s relationship been labelled as love: “when Emily Brontë traces the bond between Heathcliff and Catherine, she invents a violent affect, like a kinship between two wolves, which above all should not be mistaken for love” (1994: 175). In the novel there is a passage connected with the line being analyzed here: “They both promised to grow up as rude as savages” (Brontë, 1990: 36). Indeed, the lyrics “fall in green” could also be an allusion to the process of falling in love. These lines are represented in both videos by means of Catherine’s representation of the moors, since she moves with the wind, an aspect which is easier to appreciate in the American version.

“You had a temper like my jealousy / Too hot too greedy” (3-4) is the very first presentation of their opposite feelings, a duality reflected by the songwriter by means of a comparison of idiosyncrasy. What it is being illustrated here is that they also share a special type of feeling apparently antithetic or incompatible with their ideal passion: jealousy, greed. This is nothing but selfishness, the strong desire of wanting more and more: possession, an idea to insist on the following stanzas. The adjective jealous, when connected to Catherine, may be shocking for Heathcliff never did anything to bother Catherine or make her feel jealous. In fact, it was Catherine who made him feel so when she decided to maintain close links with Linton, which resulted in Heathcliff’s runaway for three years and Catherine’s wedding with Edgar Linton. In the book, this aftermath is illustrated by Nelly as follows:

Heathcliff had never been heard of since the evening of the thunder-storm, and, one day, I had the misfortune, when she [Catherine] has provoked me exceedingly, to lay the blame of his disappearance on her (where indeed it belonged, as she well knew) (Brontë, 1990: 69)
These two lines here analyzed ("You had a temper like my jealousy / Too hot too greedy", lines 3-4) are expressed in the UK’s version with Cathy’s stretching her arm, maybe to approach an imaginary Heathcliff. Something similar happens in the American video, where she looks right when talking about his temper and then looks to the front where she talks about her jealousy. In the moment she sings the last line, Cathy touches her throat, as if she were thirsty or in need due to Heathcliff’s not addressing her (she might be also torturing herself, as she does in the novel, when letting go in a process of self-consumption). A selfish act is represented then; remember how she married Linton for economic proposes and social status, and how Heathcliff disappeared for three years and came back looking for revenge when she decided to follow her own way. The villain, who did not forget her, was the victim of Cathy’s choice. However, in the song, Cathy is not as empowered as she is in the novel, where all the events stem from her decisions. This is the reason why she begs Heathcliff and gets involved in a no-way-out journey in Kate Bush’s song, since she cannot come back but tries hard to and means to change things that are now impossible to change. Bush’s bet is, by the way, an interesting and risky spin-off of such a story.

In the same stanza, the lines “How could you leave me / When I needed to possess you?” (5-6) go hand in hand with the passage previously commented: Heathcliff’s disappearance due to Catherine’s lack of sensibility towards him. Since the tense is the past, it leads the listener to think that Catherine is talking from beyond, which denotes once more the separation between Heathcliff and Catherine’s worlds: the living and the dead. Here, possess may refer to Cathy’s desires for possessing and owning him, and this is the idea already present in the first line of the lyrics. On the whole, the two lines represent a distorted idea, since it was not Heathcliff the one who abandoned her, but Catherine by marrying a man she did not love as much as Heathcliff. These ideas are represented in the videos by grief and pain looks in Cathy’s stares.

The stanza ends with “I hated you, I loved you too” (7), the second opposition and probably the easiest interpretation of her contrastive and mixed feelings shown in the lyrics.

---

27 Catherine appears in a double-exposure effect in this video (one in a full shot and the other in a medium shot of her upper body), indicating a closed system of communication, she being both addresser and addressee. There is no addressee but herself. Catherine’s love relationship with Heathcliff is approached in this study as an obsession. The base for that assumption is no other than the ups and downs they go through in the novel and their toxic relationship. On the whole, for an outsider, it is difficult to comprehend Cathy’s and Heathcliff’s complex behaviour. In Kate Bush’s song it seems clear that Catherine is the actual subjugated to Heathcliff in a possessive manner. The possible reason is that she died before finding some kind of redemption and Heathcliff found peace in allowing the new generation to be honest and live their love story in plenitude. At this respect, Gilbert and Gubar state that “if Heathcliff is Catherine’s almost identical double, Catherine II [Catherine’s daughter] really is her mother’s “non-identical double” (Gilbert and Gubar, 2000: 298), since little Cathy is honest not only with the people surrounding her, but with herself too.
and also in the novel. The juxtaposition provides an answer (Heathcliff was the real victim) and subordination is almost missing. This line entails the emotions felt by Catherine but also the emotions of her counterpart, Heathcliff. This line reveals the passionate, dependent but at the same time loathsome relationship they cultivated and experienced, based on pathological passion. Dependence is portrayed in the British version by Catherine’s hands bound to something (literal and metaphoric) or to someone, Heathcliff. Hatred, on the other hand, is to be retrieved from Catherine’s angry look. However, she expresses her love towards him by presenting a hypnotized gaze of admiration, laying her head on her hands, framing it within and concentrating her look on her idealized addressee, as shown in the following image:

![Catherine’s admiration for Heathcliff](image)

The second stanza, beginning with “Bad dreams in the night. / They told me I was going to lose the fight” (8-9), presents verbal ellipsis and is ambiguous. They could refer to bad dreams, but another possible interpretation is to understand they as the people surrounding Catherine, while being on the other side or while she was in the living world. A further interpretation leads the line of thought towards a question: what fight is it? It could refer to the conflict within her. A gloomy music plays in this part, which contrasts the fairy-tale atmosphere from the beginning. It seems to be a nightmare for her to cope with such a difficult situation (the fact that somebody told her that she was going to lose the fight, even

---

28 In this line, Catherine starts walking as a ghost would do in a 70s film.
29 The music that does not come out from a source actually located in the scene is known as non-diegetic sound (Beaver, 1994), and this is the usual case in video clips.
the fact that she has already lost it), which is reflected on the European video by a slight paranoid way of looking from right to left, as if she were no longer able to know what to do or believe.

“Leave behind my wuthering, wuthering / Wuthering Heights” (10-11) is the line anticipating the chorus. It could constitute a cross-reference to the passage of the novel where Cathy is ill at Thrushcross Grange and she is eager to be outdoors while she is looking at Wuthering Heights through the window. These lines present a linguistic phenomenon called desemantization, which can be appreciated by the contrast between “wuthering” (an adjective in the first two repetitions, showing the defining characteristics of the place) and “Wuthering” (the empty pre-modifier in the already assumed collocation standing for the well known place and title of the classic, a traditional and canonized reference). *Wuthering* is defined in the novel by Lockwood as follows:

Wuthering Heights is the name of Mr Heathcliff’s dwelling. “Wuthering” being a significant provincial adjective, descriptive of the atmospheric tumult to which its station is exposed in stormy weather. Pure, bracing ventilation they must have up there, at all times, indeed: one may guess the power if the north wind, blowing over the edge, by the excessive slant of a few stunted firs at the end of the house; and by a range of gaunt thorns all stretching their limbs one way, as if craving alms of the sun (Brontë, 1990: 4).

Wuthering Heights is a physical but also an allegorical place and this is reflected on Catherine’s movements: she makes a gesture with her hands over her head, as if a hurricane were above her head in the UK’s version.30 This house is a place in the real world but also in her mind, as well as a feeling, a mood, an obsession, something that does not get out of her thoughts. The fact that she “leaves behind her wuthering, wuthering, Wuthering Heights” is expressed in the American video as if something prevents her from moving on.31 Cathy is stuck on the memory of that imaginary place because she is not there anymore but means to return there to be by Heathcliff’s side. In the following image, she indicates a journey without a clear destination, and her eyes tend to look at and for something or someone out of the frame:

---

30 Indeed, Catherine ends singing the line in a close-up shot which could mean an approximation to Wuthering Heights. In the American version she makes a pirouette instead of moving her hand above her head.
31 When she sings these lines, she spins (doing a pirouette as in the UK version) and tries to touch something or someone, maybe Heathcliff. The repetition of the term “wuthering” might be enclosing her in that pivoting and no-way out movement towards the core of her obsession.
Cathy trying to reach Heathcliff

The subsequent stanza is the chorus. The songwriter recaptures the passage of *Wuthering Heights* where Catherine’s ghost appears to Lockwood. The tenant of Wuthering Heights awakes due to an annoying noise coming from the window. He approaches it to reduce the noise and sees Catherine, who wails: “Let me in –let me in!” (Brontë, 1990: 20). In addition, it may be important to remember that Kate Bush might have included this image because this was the scene that she watched on television by chance. The chorus, repeated twice, states “Heathcliff,” it’s me, your Cathy / I’ve come home, I’m so cold / Let me in-a-your window” (12-17). By means of “it’s me, your Cathy” she tries to retrieve an identity that she has lost. In the process of loving someone, sometimes the self-identity gets lost up to the point of not being able to recognize the two different identities involved. The borders of the real world and the loss of the self get blurred and it is hard to find our self again.

But identity is not the only thing that characters lose in a love relationship based on pathological dynamics. As Galán points out in his book *Identidad y Deseo en “Cumbres Borrascosas”* (1999: 119), almost all characters have undergone some type of loss. This loss is what leads the characters to behave as they do, and it has to do with the broken link between the attachment to an object or person and the one attached to it; this could be labeled as dependence or pathological relationship.

Moreover, “your Cathy” (12, 15) expresses a feeling of belonging, even the extreme grade of possession, and it seems to be a mark of subjugation to Heathcliff. The tense in “I’ve

---

32 Considering the US’s official video, a possible interpretation of her hands’ movement before her eyes when saying Heathcliff’s name in the chorus is that Cathy is blindfolded but thanks to her love she can see again.

33 The adjectivization in “Let me in-a-your window” may be that the a presented in in-a-your could derive from the *to* in *into* or from the *at* in *in at*, resulting in different meanings, obviously; the former implying an intruding access to the lover’s lair whereas the other frames the constant stay at the border, with the expectancy of being allowed to enter.
come home” implies that the action is completed (in her imagination only since it is not real): according to the tense, she has come back to the living world with Heathcliff, having an opportunity to make up for what she did to him. It would be interesting to recover the idea of Wuthering Heights as a place Catherine is bound to. In fact, the videos support this interpretation, since she makes the gestures of being handcuffed when singing “I’ve come home” (13, 16). The line “I’m so cold” (13, 16) can refer to the lack of love and lack of warmth she feels, since Heathcliff is not there with her in the dead world; this, of course, implies that she is dead. She reinforces the fact of being cold by appearing in a close-up shot performing her freezing due to Heathcliff’s absence and her desperate need of him (she touches her arms in an attempt of warming up).

On the whole, co-presentiality does not take place in any moment for what we have is a one-way conversation, a monologue rather than a dialogue. Cathy addresses Heathcliff as if he were in front of her; she asks for permission by saying “Let me in-a-your window” (14, 17). Heathcliff apparently has the key. She uses personal references as “your Cathy” (12, 15) and “your window” (14, 17) to illustrate this idea that, as it has been previously seen with the first signal of detachment (the collective we in the first line), the situation is likely to change and end in a distancing experience (we will see how she detaches from him by using third person pronouns). In addition, since this stanza is the chorus, Cathy reinforces this idea throughout the song several times, and with this she expresses the endless journey she endures once and again. The window represents a metaphorical border between both worlds; it is like the limbo or abyss in which she is. That is why she performs the same role in the two official video clips: she is in front of an invisible windowpane.

The following stanza, the whole of it, is the part of the lyrics where she realizes her state, her limitations, the never-ending process and admits her subjugation (“My only master”, line 24). After the chorus, the lines “Ooh, it gets dark! It gets lonely / On the other side from you” (18-19) seem explicit in the sense that Catherine openly assumes to be in a place away

---

34 It is interesting to consider the angles and type of shots taken while Catherine sings the chorus in the UK video, though the choreography remains the same in both. Changes appear according to editing (symmetries, shots, etc.). When she says Heathcliff’s name, she is seen in a full shot. On the contrary, the female character is seen in a medium shot most of the times that she sings the chorus without including his name. This may imply that she feels free with Heathcliff’s company.

35 It is in the European version where the symmetries appearing in the video fade away throughout the whole chorus to let three figures of Cathy appear in the image for some seconds, supporting this idea of co-presentiality of her opposite feelings.

36 The figure on the core of the image in the UK video appears doing a pirouette and dancing, whereas she appears on the symmetries on the left and right side doing a somersault that meets on the central image, possibly meaning the union she wants to experiment with Heathcliff.

37 At this point, her body language can also imply that she is thirsty or even that she has something to say deep within her because she indicates that something burns her from the inside.
from Heathcliff’s. These lines express a contrast with the first one, since the moors are green (living world) but now she is in a dark space (dead world). She is on the dead world while she is still in the place of the living, and this is clearly showed in UK’s video, when two images of Cathy are confronted while saying these lines, illustrating there is no one but her, she being both the addressee and the addressee. In fact, in the American video clip this separation between worlds is also represented by Cathy’s swinging from one side to the other, which reminds the audience of the movement along the moors (as in previous lines). Moreover, Catherine turns around from her original position (in a couple of times) making clear the two different dimensions (the living and the dead) where they are situated.

“I pine a lot. I find the lot / Falls through without you” (20-21) is a reference to her suffering, pain and harm. Catherine admits that she misses Heathcliff in the place where they used to play: the moors referred in preceding lines and in the novel itself. In the UK’s version, Cathy’s movements make allusion to this place, when she seems to emerge from the ground where the young children used to spend the day together. The lot could also be a metaphoric reference, this being the allegorical space Heathcliff occupies in her life and heart, which is empty now that they are worlds apart. Here is another clue for the distancing process commented above. Cathy does not address Heathcliff using a second person pronoun, but a third person one as in “I’m coming back to his side, to put it right” (26).

It continues with “I’m coming back, love / Cruel Heathcliff” (22-23) which is an opposition with what has been previously commented on with respect to the chorus. While Catherine says in the chorus “I’ve come home” (13, 16), now she changes it into “I’m coming back, love”, stating that she is still enduring the (apparently unreachable) coming back to Wuthering Heights. A contrast both love and cruel is also established, presenting the two sides of their love and the duality this entails. The final lines to this stanza read “my one dream / My only master” (23-24), while Cathy emphasizes that he is her sole dream, implying that he was impossible to turn into reality. This expresses Catherine’s unconditional love to him, and how she depends on his identity to preserve hers. She also says that he is her master, the one to own her, an idea related to the loss of the self and its consecutive subjugation. This
ultimate idea is expressed in both video clips thanks to Catherine choreography, but with some differences to be explained. In UK’s video version she seems to be handcuffed to Heathcliff, hence her identity loss and consecutive subjugation. However, in the American rendition she makes the gesture of being handcuffed (due to the way she joins them), but she also seems to be a butterfly (a symbol traditionally associated to death but also to freedom and liberty), unable to flap its wings because of Heathcliff’s clipping them. It also seems to be, however, an image of a handcuffed Cathy due to the way in which she joins her hands.

The next stanza, starting with “Too long I roam in the night” (25) is connected to her errant state, the wandering ghost perspective given by Kate Bush. Indeed, both video versions illustrate her wandering nature, shown in her swinging arms, like an insistence on Cathy’s crossing the lines dividing the lovers’ worlds. Being now a drift, she seems to have the objective of continuing their love story. The following line says “I’m coming back to his side to put it right” (26), is an allusion to Catherine’s desire of returning to the dimension of the living. Therefore, she wants to amend and enhance the situation. What is more, she seems to be conscious of the circumstances when she says “his side” (the consequence of her realization the impossibility of her desires), while in previous lines she has been directly pointing to Heathcliff and talking of “you”. This is a progressive change from “we” (2) to “you” (12) and then to “his” (26), and reflects the detaching process (which is passive because she does not seem to be aware of it) of Catherine from Heathcliff.

Her ghost finishes the stanza by saying “I’m coming home to wuthering, wuthering / Wuthering Heights” (27-28), object of a desemantization already commented on and the moment when she suddenly realizes of her state, being away from Heathcliff and subjugated to his will. It differs from the last line in the second stanza stating “Leave behind my wuthering, wuthering / Wuthering Heights” (10-11) because now Catherine is in an never-ending journey returning home; she does not say “I’ve come home” anymore, which would express the finalization of her endless journey. Moreover, the repetition involves a new sign of her continuous and cyclical journey, which is by the way reinforced by several pirouettes in the American video.

---

44 The camera zooms out (until the shot is a full one) when Cathy sings this line on the first version, just at the same time she swings her arms, probably relating to her wandering nature. She has a steady look in her eyes. The camera is zooming out and it ends in a full shot of Catherine. When the chorus reappears, she does a somersault again with a mixture of delayed but also advancing effect, and then she appears doing another pirouette with this same effect, similar to a time lapse.

45 It is interesting to note that Cathy reappears as the double symmetry of the beginning in the UK version (to reinforce the idea of herself being both addresser and addressee); on the left, a medium shot of her partial figure and on the right, a full shot of her body. This effect starts in the line “I’m so cold” (13, 16), as in the previous
After the repetition of the chorus, a new stanza is introduced. “Ooh, let me have it. / Let me grab your soul away” (35-38), written a couple of times, is connected in meaning with the first stanza line “I needed to possess you” (6). Cathy recovers the second person to refer to Heathcliff, interrupting the progressive distancing process, even though she wants to “grab his soul away”. She also accepts she is the slave under his master’s rule and desires to be the agent and victimizer once again, driving him to her side, to the other side of the window. These words are a wish that has been achieved, but to fully understand this it would be necessary to have a look at the passage in the novel where Catherine dies and Heathcliff grieves over her death, summoning Catherine’s tormented ghost forever:

May she wake in torment! (…) And I pray one prayer –I repeat it till my tongue stiffens– Catherine Earnshaw, may you not rest, as long as I’m living! You said I killed you –haunt me, then! The murdered do haunt their murderers, I believe. I know that ghosts have wandered on earth. Be with me always –take any form– drive me mad! Only do not leave me in this abyss, where I cannot find you! Oh, God! It is unutterable! I cannot live without my life! I cannot live without my soul! (Brontë, 1990: 129).

The meaning of these lines is fully conveyed thanks to the videos’ support. In the European video clip she pulls of an imaginary rope (symbol of the limits between her lover and Catherine, as the window is), trying to reach Heathcliff’s soul or crossing the lines. If Cathy has achieved her entrance to the living world, she could be demanded by the afterlife to return to the world that she knows she now belongs to. The second time the lyrics are repeated, Catherine seems to be crawling towards his lover. She does this action with effort, as if she were trying to escape from the place where she has been twenty years, as her ghost told Lockwood in the novel when she asked him to let her into the house and he answered:

“Begone!” I shouted, “I’ll never let you in, not if you beg for twenty years!”

“It’s twenty years,” mourned the voice, “twenty years, I’ve been a waif for twenty years!” (Brontë, 1990: 20)

repetition of the chorus. When Cathy says Heathcliff’s name, similar effects to the time lapse emerge again, a more marked delayed effect appearing.

46 Catherine is attracted backwards to something, as if someone was tugging at her. This is clearer seen in the United Kingdom version.

47 Apart from this, in the American video, she moves her fingers while saying “soul” maybe to express the spiritual realm of its genesis, the abstract, probably to denote its intangibility. Perhaps, it can also be in connection with the butterfly symbol commented above.
Cathy pulling of an allegorical rope: the ghost and her lover’s frontier

The last line of this stanza reads “You know it’s me, Cathy!” (39), directly addressing her lover, constituting an example of how Catherine has lost her identity and tries to bolster it by means of Heathcliff’s reassurance. This sudden glimpse of assertiveness leads her to assume he must identify, name and empower her.

Using Freudian theories linked to romances and love in general, and considering Freud’s studies dealing with identity and its loss, a distinction is drawn between being in love (infatuation in the case of our main characters, hence they go a step further) and hypnosis. Freud stated in Group Psychology and the Analysis of the Ego (1922), the concept of love involves several types of emotional relationships, but problems arise when its veracity and reality are questioned. Thus the philosopher concludes that there are several stages to catalogue within love, and it seems true that Heathcliff’s and Catherine’s relationship is one of those possibilities difficult to label.

Catherine reinforces the “you” in the lyrics by pointing at Heathcliff standing in front of her in the official video clips, as in the following still:

48 Then, Catherine moves her hand towards her right when she says her name, maybe indicating that she is on the other side from Heathcliff’s. Cathy identifies herself with him, she only knows what she is and where she stands because she addresses the villain, who is there to support her self-assurance, reflected on the novel by Catherine’s words “Nelly, I am Heathcliff” (Brontë, 1990: 64). But it can also represent the way she has changed her nature, how she has gone away (died) and, consequently, changed from being a human to become a ghost. The double image slowly overlaps with the image of Cathy doing a pirouette in a full shot again, but now she is reflected in symmetry below, a mirror-like effect. When the chorus starts she goes back and forth, aimlessly, until a medium shot appears showing Cathy behind an invisible windowpane. After these symmetries, the camera slowly zooms in up to the end of the lyrics.

In the American version she also expresses with the help of her arms how she is on the ground and now in the air, as if she were a puzzle whose feelings, personifying a hurricane, make a mess with her pieces and Heathcliff’s heart. Another possible interpretation is that of her human condition (ground) and her current ghost essence (air), how she changes from being alive to be dead, from calmness to agitation.
The song ends repeating the chorus (a refrain of her ideas) and finishing with “Heathcliff, it’s me, your Cathy / I’ve come home. I’m so cold” (46-47). The ghost does not insist on Heathcliff’s opening the window for her anymore. This may mean that she has entered the living world (she is back to her imagined landscapes, after realizing she has no answer) or maybe that she gives up because she realizes the impossibility of such an action. The song finishes after singing the chorus twice and reinforcing the idea of her cyclical journey, the third being slightly shortened: “Heathcliff, it’s me, your Cathy / I’ve come home, I’m so cold” (46-47). The verb tense in “I’ve come home” implies that for her the act of crossing the lines and reach Heathcliff is completed.

To sum up, in the lyrics of the song a tormented ghost tries to recover what Catherine lost while being alive, as narrated in the novel: her beloved Heathcliff. She presents opposite feelings and dualities throughout the song, as well as the dead world environment and enquiries to assure an access into the living world with her lover.

Even though the European video was sometimes criticized, for some people it is just a masterpiece. The creation of Keith “Keef” MacMillan is a consequence of the video composition trend in the 70s. Cutting-edge technology was now available and made possible to improve the framing, the equally balanced composition in the adding of different shots as well as the texture of the images and the symmetries. The mimic character of Kate Bush was

---

49 In the European release, Catherine starts swinging her arms again, but the choreography stays the same in the chorus, a possible to allusion to the movement of the moors.
50 The images shown at this point in the UK’s video clip correspond to the wandering ghost again. This could all imply a farewell because she decides to stop that never-ending experience with no success. When this image smoothly disappears, it overlaps the image of her wandering ghost, in order to be the sole protagonist while the music still plays.
52 As, for instance, new editing effects and mixing consoles.
compared with the Japanese theatre and the silent films by some critics. In the moment that the singer released the video, she was strongly influenced by her dance and mime teacher Lindsay Kemp, who also taught Bowie. Bush was inspired with new movements and expressive videos.

In the second version of the video, when Catherine sings Heathcliff’s name she seems to be desperate, begging for his mercy (since he can respond to her requests, at least from her point of view: however, there is no answer). The last time she says his name, she tries to touch him while her ghost walks backwards, as if she were claimed from the other side to stop trying to get into the living world. Catherine touches her body, probably with something burning her from the inside, going down and up, ending in her mouth: possibly the guilty feeling. In the final stage she starts to wander again, moving her arms from one side to the other, saying goodbye or making reference to the tricky “wiley” (1) way in which the moors grow and the wind makes them move. Then Catherine’s ghost is presented more and more distant in a cut zoom out, disappearing and reappearing, till she finally appears no more. The cyclical journey ends. An interesting idea that stems from this second version is that Heathcliff can be interpreted as a symbol of Cathy’s freedom, since almost every time Catherine says his name she opens her arms and moves in a very expressive way.

The two video versions here analyzed and compared present differences according to setting, edition aspects (symmetries), garments and the general attitude of Cathy’s performance. Whereas the choreography remains the same in both video clips, her facial expressions are more relaxed and show less grief and pain in the American release. Moreover, the listener and viewer of these musical representations are not witnesses of Cathy’s evolution but of her devolution because she does not advance but stays the same. The lyrics show a distancing experience (we, you, he) in which she sometimes tries to get direct contact with Heathcliff, but it turns out to be a one-way conversation with no reply or feedback. Catherine detaches herself from that experience by firstly using “we”, then moving on to “you” (as if she had him in front of her), to use “he”. The detachment process stops when she uses again “you”, a signal of her cyclical and never-ending journey.

54 Dealing with editing, as an important feature in “Wuthering Heights” videos, it would be interesting to consider the concept of invisible editing. Being examined by many semiotic analysts, it is a complementary characteristic when facing the stage of (visible) editing. The managers of this creative step codify the information for the viewers, and present this code as a narrative structure. Although some critics of this film field do not support the view of all music videos having such a structure, it seems true that Kate Bush’s “Wuthering Heights” does. It fits in within this terminology since the observers may be able to see the starting point and the ending of Catherine’s wandering state (with no destiny) in the abyss between the living and the dead; between heaven and hell, and with no way out.
5. CONCLUSION

Emily Brontë, her doppelgänger Catherine and Kate Bush are three women who defied the customs of their time to free themselves from the slavery and subjugation of such epochs. Although Bush was not against feminism (she did not think of it being actually necessary, so she did not support the movement), and Brontë did not touch on this aspect, they somehow influenced their generations.

The author and the singer did not want to be subdued to men or society in general. Neither did Catherine, but Bush interpretation from beyond (the song, written from a ghost’s perspective) leads the listener to think so, since her role as Cathy begs for Heathcliff’s acceptance, his welcome and clearly shows her subjugation. The Cathy portrayed by the young artist in her song is totally dependent on Heathcliff, who she denies in the original story by marrying Linton. Her identity is irrevocably connected to his, something curious if we take into account the fact of his unclear backgrounds and unknown social status. Both lovers live life through each other’s; they cannot be without the other, they need themselves to continue.

The couple, Cathy and Heathcliff, feels an intense love and they lose their own selves when being part of the other. But Linton is also part of Catherine’s two-sided love, which is by nature indivisible. She has loved Heathcliff since she was a young little girl and viceversa. But his economical dependence and inability to reach a higher position in society leads her to choose Edgar Linton as her husband. This decision will torture her in Bush’s song.

Catherine and Heathcliff’s pathological passion goes beyond its own limitations. Kate Bush’s is an original but a spin-off of the story originally created by Emily Brontë. The singer goes in depth into Catherine’s mind and develops a new perspective not provided by the writer. Whereas in the novel the female character is the one who directs the events occurring in the plot (and the responsible of the consequences), in Bush’s spin-off she is shown as the victim of her own destiny, and left with no redemption or peace. Heathcliff finds peace in the novel by allowing the new generation to live their love story without obstacles, and now Catherine tries to find it too in Bush’s song.

In the song, Catherine is a wandering ghost looking for a sign of her lover. The lyrics start talking about the moors, the place that links the writer and the singer. The moors remind the main female character of the moments when Heathcliff and she played on the wild spaces surrounding Wuthering Heights. One of the readings of the use of past tenses indicate that she
is not speaking from the present; a proof of her errant existence on the limbo between the living and the dead world. Catherine fails again into the magma of pathological passion.

Another tense-related feature is found in the chorus, where she states “I’ve come home”, as if the action were completed, but in reality it is not. Physical and spiritual barriers appear to avoid the encounter of Catherine with the villain.

She desperately tries to get Heathcliff on the limbo too (in order to be together) because of her guilty tendency. Catherine is so confused that she starts a cyclical period in which she is not able to see its endless movement because of her standstill in the abyss between both worlds. Instead of stopping this retroactive experience, Catherine feeds this situation back. Hers is not an evolution but a devolution process, as it is approached in the lyrics as well as in the video clip releases. The explanation is found on Cathy’s use of “you”, to change it then into “he” (to portray that the distancing process stops at some point in the lyrics because she realizes of real existence and the boundary separating Heathcliff from her). However, Catherine uses again second person pronouns to convey the meaning of the chorus: her asking for permission to enter Heathcliff’s world.

The woman portrayed undergoes an experience of detaching herself not only from Heathcliff’s world, but from reality as well. Moreover, the ending of the song is a repetition of the chorus but with a slight change: Cathy does not repeat “Let me in-a-your window” anymore. With this she finally realizes the cyclical devolution process and she prevents it from continuing.

In the video version released for the United Kingdom and Europe in general, Cathy’s movements are more explicit, whereas the American official video clip’s choreography is less expressive. The explicitness is due to the symmetries of the former video version (making allusion to her changing and dual nature), and also to how Catherine is the only speaker and the only listener in both video clips. She is the addresser of her words but also the addressee, thus Heathcliff does not provide her with an answer.

By comparing the lyrics’ work by Kate Bush (hypertext, using Genette’s terminology) with Brontë’s narration (hypertext), the reader and/or listener discovers the intentions of Catherine (meeting Heathcliff by crossing the lines) in a hypothetical aftermath, and understands her desperate state in her searching for a man that does not belong to her world anymore.
6. BIBLIOGRAPHY

WEB SOURCES

www.katebush.com (Last visit 26/4/16)
www.victorianweb.org (Last visit 30/4/16)
http://genius.com/1953016 (Last visit 1/6/16)
http://gaffa.org/garden/kate1.html#int (Last visit 30/5/16)
http://www.katebushencyclopedia.com/ (Last visit 24/4/16)
http://www.bbc.co.uk/music/reviews/nm9x (Last visit 24/4/16)
http://gaffa.org/cloud/subjects/feminism.html (Last visit 2/6/16)
http://www.wuthering-heights.co.uk/famous-scenes.php (Last visit 1/6/16)
http://www.interviewmagazine.com/music/kate-bush/#_ (Last visit 6/5/16)
http://www.haworth-village.org.uk/brontes/emily/emily.asp (Last visit 30/4/16)
http://www.rollingstone.com/music/artists/kate-bush/biography (Last visit 16/4/16)
http://visual-memory.co.uk/daniel/Documents/S4B/sem10.html (Last visit 23/7/16)
http://www.bronte.org.uk/the-brontes-and-haworth/wuthering-heights (Last visit 1/6/16)
http://www.allmusic.com/artist/kate-bush-mn0000855423/biography (Last visit 24/4/16)
https://www.theguardian.com/music/2014/aug/21/kate-bush-queen-of-art-pop-defied-critics-london-concerts (Last visit 24/4/16)
http://www.rockdelux.com/audio-video/p/kate-bush-wuthering-heights.html (Last visit 20/4/16)